

APPEAL	Non NABC+ EIGHT
Subject	Misinformation (MI)
DIC	Millard Nachtwey
Event	0-5000 Spingold
Session	1 st Round – First Session
Date	July 17, 2006

BD#	18
VUL	N/S
DLR	East

2,500 Masterpoints	
♠	T 9 8 x x x
♥	9 x
♦	J x
♣	J T x

150 Masterpoints	
♠	
♥	T x x x x
♦	Q x x x x x x
♣	K

1,500 Masterpoints	
♠	K Q x
♥	A J x
♦	A T 9
♣	Q x x x

3,000 Masterpoints	
♠	A J x x
♥	K Q x
♦	K
♣	A x x x x

West	North	East	South
		1NT ¹	Dbl ²
2♠ ³	Pass	Pass	Dbl
3♦	3♠	Pass	Pass
4♦	Pass	Pass	Dbl
Pass	Pass	Pass	

Final Contract	4♦ doubled by West
Opening Lead	♠T
Table Result	4♦ doubled making 4, E/W +510
Director Ruling	4♠ by South, down 1, E/W +100
Panel Ruling	4♦ doubled making 4, E/W +510

(1)	15-17 HCP.
(2)	Penalty, as good or better than 1NT.
(3)	This was not Alerted and was explained after the 3♦ call with the director and West away from the table. At least one minor. Partner bids 2NT if he likes clubs and 3♣ if he likes diamonds.

The Facts: 2♠ was not Alerted. After the 3♦ bid, East asked West to leave the table and then explained that the 2♠ bid was obviously not natural. The director was called. The 2♠ bid was explained as a transfer for the minors. South said she would leave in her reopening double if told 2♠ was minors.

The Ruling: It was decided that South's double of 4♦ was based on misinformation about the 2♠ bid. It was decided that with correct information that South would bid 4♠ rather than double. In accordance with laws 40C and 12C2, the director adjusted the score to 4♠ by North down one, N/S -100.

The Appeal: South said that she doubled 4♦ believing “transfer to minors” meant that West’s 2♠ call showed both minors. She doubled because of her club holding in West’s presumed second suit. If she had known that 2♠ only promised one minor, she would have bid 4♣ over 4♦. South maintained to the table director that she would reopen the auction in passout seat over 2♠ with a double had she been told that 2♠ showed at least one minor and was not natural. She repeated this statement twice to the screening director, then said she felt passing 2♠ would be better and she would not reopen with a double if properly informed.

E/W acknowledged the MI from not properly Alerting and explaining West’s 2♠ bid but felt their subsequent explanation should have clarified the auction for N/S. South’s double of 4♦ was made with full knowledge of the meaning of 2♠.

The Decision: South is an experienced player with 3,000 masterpoints (partner has 2,500). South agreed she was very slow to realize her best action was to pass 2♠, not reopen with a double. She also agreed she could have asked to clarify the meaning of “transfer to minors” to see if it did, indeed, show clubs and diamonds. 2♠ was clearly not properly Alerted and explained. Had South said she would have passed 2♠ rather than reopening with a double, the panel would have accepted that and assigned a result of 2♠ by West, probably down four for N/S +200. However, South, an experienced player, told both the table director and the screening director that she would still have doubled over 2♠ if given the correct Alert and explanation, only much later changing her mind and realizing that passing 2♠ was the best action for her side. As such, she was judged not to have wanted to change her call in reopening seat.

After the reopening double, the E/W auction was explained. The explanation “transfer to the minors” should have been understood by a player of South’s experience. If vague, South should have asked for clarification about the issue of whether it showed both minors or just one. South’s decision to assume a meaning for an ambiguous answer was South’s responsibility and was not protected by law (21A). As such, the panel felt South’s decision to double 4♦ rather than bid 4♣ was based on her own misunderstanding not the opponent’s incorrect or unclear explanation. The table result of 4♦ doubled making four, E/W +510 was restored as law 40C did not apply.

The Panel: Peter Marcus (Reviewer), Candy Kushner, Charles MacCracken, Matt Smith and Gary Zeiger.

Players Consulted: None.